

Inklings Forever

Volume 7 A Collection of Essays Presented at the
Seventh Frances White Ewbank Colloquium on C.S.
Lewis & Friends

Article 7

6-3-2010

Creation and Sub-creation in Leaf by Niggle

J. Samuel Hammond

Marie K. Hammond

Follow this and additional works at: https://pillars.taylor.edu/inklings_forever

 Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#), [History Commons](#), [Philosophy Commons](#), and the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Hammond, J. Samuel and Hammond, Marie K. (2010) "Creation and Sub-creation in Leaf by Niggle," *Inklings Forever*: Vol. 7 , Article 7.

Available at: https://pillars.taylor.edu/inklings_forever/vol7/iss1/7

This Essay is brought to you for free and open access by the Center for the Study of C.S. Lewis & Friends at Pillars at Taylor University. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Inklings Forever* by an authorized editor of Pillars at Taylor University. For more information, please contact pillars@taylor.edu.

INKLINGS FOREVER, Volume VII

A Collection of Essays Presented at the Seventh
FRANCES WHITE COLLOQUIUM on C.S. LEWIS & FRIENDS
Taylor University 2010
Upland, Indiana

Creation and Sub-creation in *Leaf by Niggle*

J. Samuel Hammond and Marie K. Hammond

In his essay *On Fairy Stories* and his poem *Mythopoeia*, J.R.R. Tolkien describes the concept of sub-creation. The story *Leaf by Niggle*, published as a companion and complement to the essay, illustrates this concept and shows how it relates to Creation. In particular, the story presents Tolkien's ideas about art, employment, and responsibility toward neighbors. It paints a perceptive portrait of the author himself. Moreover, it offers inspiration for artists, writers, scholars, and all who engage in constructive labor, and gives guidance to those who (like the author) feel the pressure of too much work. Perhaps most importantly, this fascinating tale conveys to the reader Truth inherent in Creation.

Creation and Sub-creation in *Leaf by Niggle*

J. Samuel Hammond and Marie K. Hammond

J.R.R. Tolkien was an artisan and a scholar. His story entitled *Leaf by Niggle* offers a perceptive portrait of the author as well as gentle guidance for people like himself who feel the pressure of too much work. Tolkien's ideas about art, employment, and responsibility toward neighbor are presented in this enchanting story. Through fiction he illustrates his concept of sub-creation and shows how it relates to Creation. *Leaf by Niggle* can inspire not only artists, but also writers, scholars, gardeners, and all who engage in constructive labor.

Brief Summary

Niggle is a painter with a grand vision. In his mind's eye, he sees a huge Tree with shimmering leaves surrounded by a lovely country of forests and mountains. He wants more than anything to paint what he sees; however, he is constantly interrupted by his neighbor Parish and by intrusions of civic and social responsibilities. Before he can make much progress on his painting, Niggle is called away on a Journey. He is taken to a place where he is compelled to do hard labor and to rest. After a long time he hears two voices discussing his case. They send him on to the next stage, an open country with a great Tree, which Niggle soon recognizes to be a realization of his own vision. Niggle suddenly understands that to complete the painting he needs help from his former neighbor Parish, a gardener. Parish appears and they work together. Upon completion of the painting, Niggle decides to follow a shepherd into the mountains, while Parish elects to wait for his wife. Back in the old country Niggle is remembered briefly as a minor painter and then forgotten entirely. In the new

country his complete vision, now called Niggle's Parish, has become a refreshing stopover for travelers.

The Author's Plight

It is generally recognized that Professor Tolkien was an exceedingly busy man, pulled in many directions by the demands of university work, writing, and family responsibilities. This was certainly the case in 1938-9, when *Leaf by Niggle* was probably written.¹ During these same years, he was working on *Lord of the Rings*, two other short stories, and various academic projects. To help pay household expenses and tuition for his children's schooling, he took on extra work grading papers.² Yet his own daughter was not aware of all he was doing. Many years later she said, "It was not until adult life that I gradually came to realize how continuously hard he worked. In order to take part in family life as he did and be so available to our needs and interests he often had to work far into the night when the household was quiet."³

Tolkien pursued additional interests outside his family and professional obligations. He sketched and painted frequently throughout his life. A close observer of nature, he delighted in long walks through the countryside. Indeed, his affection for trees, leaves and gardens is apparent in both his writing and his drawing.⁴

Somehow the professor was able to reconcile and balance these many activities. Yet the story *Leaf by Niggle* contains evidence that he was considering such questions as: How can one's time be most efficiently used? Does art take precedence over practical work? Where does duty lie? What value does art have to justify the time and effort expended? The same questions are integral to the themes entwined in *Leaf by Niggle*.

Sub-creation

Tolkien's concept of sub-creation, discussed in his essay *On Fairy Stories*, may be defined as "the process of inventing an imaginary or secondary world, different from the primary world but internally consistent."⁵ Applying this definition broadly, one might regard any artist as a sub-creator, assuming that a consistent secondary world can be rendered not only in a story, but also in a painting, a musical composition, a dance, or a drama. Indeed it is possible that a flower garden might be a work of art and its designer a sub-creator.

Who is entitled to attempt sub-creation? Tolkien gives clues in his poem *Mythopoeia*.⁶

The heart of man is not compound of lies,
but draws some wisdom from the only Wise,
and still recalls him. Though now long estranged,
man is not wholly lost nor wholly changed. (lines 53-56)

A few lines later, he describes man as

sub-creator, the refracted light
through whom is splintered from a single White
to many hues, and endlessly combined
in living shapes that move from mind to mind. (61-64)

In other words, human beings are able to invent imaginary worlds by drawing wisdom and light from the Creator, and by redirecting or disseminating God's created light. Furthermore these actions are not static, solitary endeavors, but exchanges between imaginative minds combining their ideas and insights. While humans have long been estranged from God, they still possess the spark of invention, the right to imitate Creation.

The right has not decayed.
We make still by the law in which we're made. (69-70)

This is apparently one aspect of having been created in the image of God. Therefore it seems that any human being is a potential sub-creator. Later in the poem, Tolkien expresses sympathy and admiration for ark-builders, legend-makers, minstrels, and questing mariners, people from different walks of life engaged in their own imaginative endeavors.

Niggle's Characteristics

Turning now to *Leaf by Niggle*, one finds many of the same ideas. The most obvious sub-creator in the story is the artist Niggle, in many ways representative of Tolkien himself. One clear link between them is artistic calling. Tolkien was trying to produce something like Niggle's painting, a huge and glorious representation of an entire country. When he wrote *Leaf by Niggle*, Tolkien had already been working for over twenty years on the complex history, mythology, and philology of Middle Earth that would become *The Silmarillion*. He kept adding to the story, telling and retelling certain parts, modifying characters and stylistic elements.⁷ Niggle, too, worked incrementally on his painting.

Niggle lost interest in his other pictures; or else he took them and tacked them on to the edges of his great picture. Soon the canvas became so large that he had to get a ladder; and he ran up and down it, putting in a touch here, and rubbing out a patch there.⁸

Niggle is described as overreaching his talent, trying to paint pictures "too large and ambitious for his skill." (p. 81) While he is unique in his way, he is "also a very ordinary and rather silly little man." (p. 82) These statements reflect Tolkien's uncertainty about his own ability to complete the mammoth project he had undertaken.⁹

The character's name suggests that Tolkien considered himself a "niggler" who did not accomplish as much as he thought he should. Yet an artist need not be exceptionally brilliant or efficient to participate in sub-creation. Niggle is an ordinary man who paints leaves better than trees. He wants his picture to keep growing but eventually realizes it must have boundaries. The leaf, as a representation of Niggle's limited ability, is a rich and appropriate symbol for Tolkien's own artistic expression. After all, the word "leaf" also denotes a page in a book. Tolkien's writing was akin to painting a huge tree, one small leaf at a time. The leaf is also associated with failure and new beginnings, as when one "turns over a new leaf." In the

story, Niggle's efforts finally bear fruit, and most people would agree that Tolkien's did as well. By persisting in small efforts, an artist can sometimes bring to realization a much larger vision.

During his mortal life, however, Niggle wastes time. He has too many things to do but lacks the diligence to do any of them well. The attention he gives his artwork interferes with other duties. For example, the large painting he works on requires a shed that takes the place of his potato plot. He neglects to weed the remainder of his garden. He does not volunteer to supply materials or labor to repair Parish's house. At last, an Inspector shows up, declaring that house repair takes precedence over painting. "That's the law," he says. (p. 87) Readers are reminded of a higher law, that one should love one's neighbors and do for them what we would want them to do for us. Niggle's life can best be described as a muddle; his problems arise because "[his heart] did not function properly ... [a]nd his head was not screwed on tight enough: he hardly ever thought at all." (p. 90) If this story is autobiographical, Tolkien was rather hard on himself!

For his faults, Niggle is taken to a place (like purgatory) where he receives "treatment." He has to work hard at all the tasks he neglected during his life. He is required to dig because he failed to weed his garden; he saws and paints wood to atone for not repairing his neighbor's roof; he sits thinking in the dark as a remedy for his frantic unthinking activity. After a while, Niggle begins to feel a bit of satisfaction at completing small and useful tasks well, and he learns to organize his time. As a sub-creator made in the image of God, Niggle (like Tolkien) learns he must relate to Creation as God relates to it: caring for, assisting, and sacrificing for those around him. Only then is Niggle allowed to resume his painting, his artistic calling to be a sub-creator.

In the end Niggle's leaf grows into "a Tree that was alive, its leaves opening, its branches growing and bending in the wind ..." (p. 94) Moreover the tree is full of birds. "They were mating, hatching, growing wings, and flying away singing into the Forest, even while he looked at them." (p. 95) When Niggle explores the country surrounding this tree full of life, he discovers that his painting has unexpected depth. "You could go on and on, and have a whole country in a garden, or in a picture (if you preferred to call it that)." (p. 95) Here Niggle's painting is identified with a garden that contains a Tree of Life; the scene suggests Eden, thus reinforcing the connection between sub-creation (art) and Creation. Indeed Niggle has been working in a garden all along, but in the old country he neglected his own garden and did not properly appreciate his neighbor's.

In the new country Niggle is better able to perceive the true source of his art. When he recognizes his own tree, finished and come alive, he proclaims, "It's a gift!" (p. 94) and Tolkien adds, "He was referring to his art, and also to the result; but he was using the word quite literally." In other words, Niggle's ability to paint is not merely a talent he possesses (for which he can take pride or claim credit) but a true gift from God; so is the completed painting. Niggle is granted a vision of heaven in his lifetime which he attempts to translate by means of art. Later he is given the fulfillment of that vision.

Tolkien's art was also a gift. This story, he told his publisher, came into his head fully formed, perhaps in a dream. "I woke up one morning (more than two years ago) with that odd thing virtually complete in my head."¹⁰ The author mentions another source, a great poplar tree he could see from his bed. When it was severely pruned and later cut down, Tolkien mourned. While he surely did not consider it a gift at the time, the loss of this tree became an inspiration for a wonderful story. In a more general sense, Tolkien's faith inspired his work.¹¹ Thus a

close connection between Creation and sub-creation may again be observed, since the inspiration for art comes from the original gift-Giver, the Creator. Tolkien hoped for another link between what an artist invents and what God creates.

Probably every writer making a secondary world, a fantasy, every sub-creator, wishes in some measure to be a real maker, or hopes that he is drawing on reality: hopes that the peculiar quality of this secondary world (if not all the details) are derived from Reality, or are flowing into it.¹²

Ideally the secondary world invented by an author should reflect the created world in which we live.

Parish's Characteristics

While Niggle the artist has obvious similarities to Tolkien, it is instructive to consider how Parish the gardener might also be a representation of the author. Niggle and Parish can be seen as two sides of the author's life: his artistic calling and his gainful employment. Parish is a serious gardener, a man who works the earth and knows how to produce excellent potatoes. At the same time, he is lame and willing to ask for help. Tolkien also was productive in his profession; along with his teaching, he wrote and edited scholarly works. Yet perhaps he too felt hobbled. In a sense, Tolkien's artistic calling was his handicap, in that it consumed much of his time and drew him away from other perceived duties.¹³

Other facets of Parish's role in the story are suggested by his name. Historically, an English parish is more than a local church. It is a geographical, legal, social, and ecclesiastical unit to which one belongs, in which one's life is lived and documented. Thus the gardener Parish is a working man, rooted in the land. His concern with ordinary activities corresponds to the practical side of Tolkien's life. Tolkien, though not a planter by profession, had great sympathy with nature and loved the land. The word parish is derived from the Greek word *paroikos*, meaning "neighbor." Parish is not a particularly good neighbor, yet he is Niggle's

neighbor in the geographical sense and in the sense of needing help. When a lawyer asked Jesus, “Who is my neighbor?”, Jesus responded with the parable of the Good Samaritan, indicating that neighbors are people who need help and the ones who provide it.¹⁴

The name Parish also sounds like the word “perish.” While this may be a purely unintentional wordplay, it nevertheless suggests things of this world that do not last. In the old country Parish is more concerned with potatoes than with paintings. Yet when he gets to the new country, it is his collaboration on a painting that has lasting value. Practical matters are important in this life, but one must also attend to those things (such as love of neighbor, faith, idealism) that do not perish. Physical artworks themselves are perishable. Niggle’s original painting is destroyed and his reputation vanishes after a short while. It is natural for any artist (or author) to worry that his works will be lost and forgotten. Yet Niggle’s work is not really lost, as Tolkien makes clear at the end of the story, and neither is Parish’s.

Achieving Balance

When they are neighbors, Parish does not appreciate Niggle’s artwork but neither does Niggle appreciate Parish’s garden. The two aspects of man’s work in the world, the practical and the artistic, are in conflict. Somehow these two aspects must be reconciled and balanced in order for a community and its members to thrive. In fact, Niggle discovers that his best artwork is produced in cooperation with Parish. “Some of the most beautiful—and the most characteristic, the most perfect examples of Niggle’s style—were seen to have been produced in collaboration with Mr. Parish: there was no other way of putting it.” (p. 92) In serving his neighbor Niggle does not waste his time, but enhances it. When artist and gardener work together, the fruits of their labor become united; Niggle’s painting and Parish’s garden ultimately coincide, and the result is more exquisite than either could have imagined. This

collaborative work of art becomes a stopover station with power to refresh and heal. Identified with both their names, it is called Niggle's Parish.

An artist may think he can achieve great things by transcending the world. Tolkien recognizes, however, that artists (like everyone else) must discharge their responsibilities in and to the world. They may even find that artistic inspiration comes in the process of doing their duty. The essay *On Fairy Stories* is a scholarly work, presumably costing the author a great deal of effort in research, writing, and revisions. Its companion piece, the story *Leaf by Niggle*, cost him "absolutely no pains at all."¹⁵ The two were written at roughly the same time, and they share certain symbols and themes. One assumes Tolkien's scholarly efforts in composing the essay helped to inspire the imaginative story. In any event, Tolkien has brought together the practical and the artistic under the title *Tree and Leaf*. Each part contributes to the search for truth, and the two reinforce each other. Katharyn Crabbe remarks upon this happy conjunction:

Even if we remain at our most conservative and do not use the word *genius*, it is clear that Tolkien was an extremely successful practitioner of the critical and creative arts. He was also a skillful and perceptive blender of the two, always willing to use the skills and insights he had developed in one area to enrich his work in the other.¹⁶

The Artist's Role

What do we learn about the place of artists in the world? Tolkien has both a very high estimation of their worth and an humble assessment of their indebtedness. Considering the latter aspect, Tolkien (and Niggle) knew that their talents and accomplishments were a gift, originating elsewhere and transmitted through themselves. An artist accepts what is given but cannot grasp more than is offered. Yet in the story, Niggle is frustrated. His own efforts are insufficient to capture the grand vision in his mind's eye. Only after he suffers for his faults, receives grace, and learns to cooperate with his neighbor does his vision come alive and grow

to completion. Each exquisite leaf is unique, yet part of a bigger picture that is subsumed into Creation itself. In this happy ending, Niggle comes to realize that, in spite of his frustration, he really is a painter.

Presumably in writing this story Tolkien came to an understanding that allowed him to carry on (while facing an uncertain future) with his large-scale projects. Randel Helms gives a thoughtful elucidation of this inference:

Tolkien's imagination-deadening fear he would not survive to design his own leaf is transmuted into an allegory about a niggling self-portrait of the artist—Niggle by name—whose creating does not stop when he dies. "Leaf by Niggle" is Tolkien's imagination's promise to itself that no genuine creation ever ceases to be, that the best of one's imaginings permanently enriches reality.¹⁷

Though an artwork may be incomplete and transitory in human terms, good art (even what is confined to the artist's imagination) has lasting value. Tolkien says that the ending of a fairy tale is like the margin of a picture; it is not the actual end, but merely shows the endlessness of the fragment.¹⁸ These notions are encouraging to artists and writers with a grand vision. Even if a work is not completed to their satisfaction, the vision counts for something and may be fulfilled and realized in unforeseen ways.

Broader Applications

Most of Tolkien's writings attest to the fact that he preferred not to evangelize in an obvious way. In a letter to his publisher he wrote: "Myth and fairy-story must, as all art, reflect and contain in solution elements of moral and religious truth (or error), but not explicit, not in the known form of the primary 'real' world."¹⁹ Yet *Leaf by Niggle* contains references that are overtly religious. His representation of purgatory, allusions to law and grace, and arbitrating voices of justice and mercy reflect doctrines of the Christian faith. Whether Tolkien intended

for this story to be a “religious” work is open to question; nevertheless it is a vehicle for communicating truth about life, death, redemption, and mystery surrounding the supernatural.

Tolkien writes more about this subject: “Something really ‘higher’ is occasionally glimpsed in mythology: Divinity, the right to power (as distinct from its possession), the due of worship: in fact ‘religion.’”²⁰ He comments in a letter to a reader about perceived “sanctity” in *The Lord of the Rings*: “If sanctity inhabits [a man’s] work or as a pervading light illumines it, then it does not come from him but through him.”²¹ Thus, at the very least, Tolkien admits the possibility of religious content in his writings. In the epilogue of *On Fairy Stories*, the author is even more explicit about these matters. He speaks of joy experienced by a reader as “a sudden glimpse of the underlying reality or truth,” which he says may be a “far-off gleam or echo of *evangelium* in the real world.”²² With appropriate humility, even trepidation, Tolkien acknowledges that finite Man can only touch upon a small part of “a truth incalculably rich.” But nevertheless, he says God has redeemed men in their artistic capacity. He compares the gospel to a fairy story and concludes:

The Evangelium has not abrogated legends; it has hallowed them, especially the ‘happy ending.’ The Christian has still to work, with mind as well as body, to suffer, hope, and die; but he may now perceive that all his bents and faculties have a purpose, which can be redeemed. So great is the bounty with which he has been treated that he may now, perhaps, fairly dare to guess that in Fantasy he may actually assist in the effoliation and multiple enrichment of creation. All tales may come true; and yet, at the last, redeemed, they may be as like and as unlike the forms that we gave them as Man, finally redeemed, will be like and unlike the fallen that we know.²³

How are Niggle’s experiences related to the Evangelium? When the Driver comes to take him on a journey (analogous to death), Niggle is not ready. Like the foolish maidens in the parable of the bridegroom (Matthew 25:1-13), he has not completed his preparations. After a time in purgatory, he is healed, given a meal resembling Holy Communion, and sent off to a new beginning. He encounters a tree, his Tree, grown large and beautiful and full of birds.

One is reminded of the tree representing the Kingdom of Heaven that grows from a grain of mustard seed into “the greatest of shrubs and becomes a tree, so that the birds of the air come and make nests in its branches.” (Matthew 13:31-32) Later Niggle is given tonic to mix with water from a spring that nourishes and invigorates him and allows him to rest from his labors. One thinks of the woman at the well who was offered living water that becomes “a spring of water welling up to eternal life.” (John 4:14) Before Niggle goes off to the mountains, he looks back at the Great Tree and sees a blossom “shining like flame.” (p. 99) In Scripture, fire sometimes indicates the presence of God, as when Moses met God in the burning bush. (Exodus 3:1ff) Niggle follows a shepherd into high pastures where “[h]e was going to learn about sheep ...” perhaps so that he could feed and tend them as Peter was commanded to do by Jesus. (John 21:15-17) While Niggle and his painting are forgotten in the “real world,” they both have a role in the work of salvation in the new country. Much like the parable of the mustard seed, a very small thing (in this case, a leaf) grows into a giant tree associated with propagation of the faith. From small beginnings (twelve witnesses in Galilee), the Christian faith is now disseminated to all corners of the earth.

Tolkien the artist and sub-creator, like his character Niggle, engages in work that is healing and redemptive. While human efforts are inevitably flawed, they can also be redeemed and come to mean more than the author intended or imagined. Readers of Tolkien’s fiction are given hope, consolation, a glimpse of joy, and valuable lessons for living. Jane Chance goes further in asserting: “All secondary worlds, all realms of Faërie in such fairy-stories ultimately are modeled upon heaven. Entering paradise remains the deepest human fantasy because it constitutes the most important escape from death and from the stronghold of this world on

life.”²⁴ She believes that when a Christian author writes fantasy, his stories are necessarily religious and very personal. This would certainly seem to be true for the story *Leaf by Niggle*.

Conclusion

J.R.R. Tolkien uses elements of the Creation story, as well as other biblical and religious imagery reflecting the created order, to develop his secondary world in the story *Leaf by Niggle*. The ideal forms of leaf, tree, and garden figure prominently in this work, suggesting a relation between the earth and the Garden of Eden. In a draft letter referring to the story Tolkien wrote, “I tried to show allegorically how [sub-creation] might come to be taken up into Creation in some plane ...”²⁵ Discussing sub-creation, he says, “Fantasy remains a human right: we make in our measure and in our derivative mode, because we are made: and not only made, but made in the image and likeness of a Maker.”²⁶ As sub-creators, human beings are themselves granted the awesome privilege of enriching creation. If Tolkien (or another sub-creator) succeeds in conveying some part of the Truth inherent in Creation, then his work will give readers insight that is helpful in their life and labor. Randel Helms ties together the benefits of this story for both author and audience:

[Tolkien] needed to tell himself in narrative, not just discursive terms ... that participation in an act of sub-creation is in fact preparation for spiritual experience, that the pleasures of Faërie are at their purest indistinguishable from spiritual joy, and finally, that fantasy can bear the Good News, in its minor way, even in the company of the evangelists themselves.²⁷

Notes

¹J.R.R. Tolkien, “Introductory Note,” *Tree and Leaf* (London, Unwin Paperbacks, 1979), p. 9.

²Richard L. Purtill, *J.R.R. Tolkien: Myth, Morality, and Religion* (San Francisco, Harper & Row, 1984), p. 21-22.

³Priscilla Tolkien, “Memories of J.R.R. Tolkien in His Centenary Year,” *The Brown Book* (December 1992), p. 13.

⁴One recalls from *Lord of the Rings* the gardener Sam Gamgee, the ents and their trees, and the Lady Galadriel’s gift of leaf-like brooches. See Wayne G. Hammond and Christina Scull, *J.R.R. Tolkien: Artist & Illustrator* (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 2000, c1995) for an excellent overview of his graphic artwork.

⁵*The Oxford English Dictionary*, 2nd ed. (1989), s.v. “sub-creation.”

⁶J.R.R. Tolkien, *Tree and Leaf: Including the Poem Mythopoeia*. Introd. by Christopher Tolkien (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1989), pp. 97-101.

⁷Katharyn F. Crabbe, *J.R.R. Tolkien* (New York, Frederick Ungar Pub. Co., 1981), pp. 24-25.

⁸J.R.R. Tolkien, “Leaf by Niggle,” *Tree and Leaf* (London, Unwin Paperbacks, 1979), p. 81.

All subsequent quotations from this story refer to the same edition and are followed by page numbers in parentheses.

⁹Tolkien tells us of his doubts in the “Introductory Note” to *Tree and Leaf*:

[*On Fairy Stories* and *Leaf by Niggle*] were written in the same period (1938-9), when *The Lord of the Rings* was beginning to unroll itself and to unfold prospects of labor and exploration in yet unknown country as daunting to me as to the hobbits. . . . I had then no more notion than they had of what had become of Gandalf or who Strider was; and I had begun to despair of surviving to find out. (p. 9)

¹⁰J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*. Selected and edited by Humphrey Carpenter; with the assistance of Christopher Tolkien (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1981) Letter 98 (ca. 18 March 1945), p. 113.

¹¹Richard Purtill states this idea succinctly: “[Tolkien] was also a Christian, and his Christianity gave him the joy and vision that finds expression in his work.” (p. 138)

¹²J.R.R. Tolkien, “On Fairy Stories,” *Tree and Leaf* (London, Unwin Paperbacks, 1979), p. 70.

¹³Jane Chance in *Tolkien's Art: A Mythology for England*. Rev. Ed. (Lexington, University Press of Kentucky, 2001) observes: "Tolkien displays a fictional self, a persona, divided by two different interests, art and philology (or literary criticism), which tug him first one way, then another." (p. 29) See also Crabbe, p. 22.

¹⁴See Luke 10:29-37. This and all subsequent biblical quotations are taken from the Revised Standard Version.

¹⁵See note 10.

¹⁶Crabbe, p. 146. John Ellison also observes the reconciliation of roles that occurs in *Leaf by Niggle*. In his essay "The 'Why' and the 'How': Reflections on 'Leaf by Niggle'," published in *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction* (London, The Tolkien Society, 1991) he states:

The theme of "the artist and society" makes its appearance. Parish, who now joins [Niggle], becomes for a while, his *alter ego*—the other, complementary half of his personality. The reconciliation of the roles of the artist and the dreamer and of the practical handyman is now complete. (p. 29)

¹⁷Randel Helms, *Tolkien's World* (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1974), p. 111.

¹⁸See Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories," p. 78.

¹⁹Tolkien, *Letters*. Letter 131 (late 1951 to Milton Waldman of Collins), p. 144.

²⁰Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories," p. 31.

²¹Tolkien, *Letters*. Letter 328 (draft, Autumn 1971 to Carole Batten-Phelps), p. 413.

²²Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories," p. 70.

²³*Ibid.*, p. 72.

²⁴Chance, p. 79.

²⁵Tolkien, *Letters*. Letter 153 (draft, September 1954 to Peter Hastings), p. 195.

²⁶Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories," p. 57.

²⁷Helms, p. 118.